IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Minutes for REVme 2023 May Interim - Orlando | | | | |
| Date: 2023-05-15 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Jon Rosdahl | Qualcomm Technology, Inc. | 10871 N 5750 W Highland, UT 84003 | +!-801-492-4023 | Jrosdahl @ ieee . org |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

Minutes for the 802.11me (REVme) for the meetings held during the 2023 May IEEE 802 Wireless Mixed-mode Interim held at the Hilton Orlando Lake Buena Vista Hotel, Lake, GA, USA, March 13-17, 2023.

R0: Original Minutes captured and posted.

1. **TGme (REVme) Mixed-mode –Monday, May 15, 2023, at 016:00-18:00 ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 4:05pm ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of** other Officers present:
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Remember that Registration** is required for this meeting and all the meetings this week as part of the 2023 May 802 Plenary.
   4. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
      1. No Issues noted.
   5. **Review Agenda: 11-23/0573r2:**
      1. Monday May 15, 4pm ET
   6. Chair’s Welcome, Policy & patent reminder
   7. Approve Agenda.
   8. Motions
      1. Minutes approval (Slide 7)
   9. Telecon on Friday May 26
   10. Editor Report
   11. Discussion on Timeline
   12. CID 3133
   13. Comment Resolution
       1. ED2 CIDs – docs 11-23/779, 11-23/810, 11-23/811 – AU (Huawei)
       2. CID 4000 4001 4002 4003 4004 4372 4394 – doc 11-23/784 – PATIL (Qualcomm)
       3. CID 4202, 4206, 4243, 4251, 4254 – RISON (Samsung)
       4. GEN Review CIDs
   14. Recess
       1. No Objection to proposed Agenda.
   15. **Motion: REVme Past Meeting Minutes:**
       1. Approve the minutes in documents:

* January Interim: 11-23/0116r1:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0116-01-000m-minutes-for-revme-2023-january-interim-baltimore.docx>

* Teleconferences:

January: 11-23/0159r1:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0159-01-000m-minutes-for-revme-2023-january-27-telecon.docx>

February: 11-23/0174r6:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0174-06-000m-minutes-for-revme-2023-february-telecons.docx>

March: 11-23/0271r0:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0271-00-000m-minutes-for-revme-2023-march-telecons.docx>

* March Plenary: 11-23/0535r0:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0435-00-000m-minutes-for-revme-2023-march-802-plenary.docx>

* + 1. Moved Jon ROSDAHL
    2. 2nd: Stephen MCCANN
    3. Results: Unanimous consent – No Objection.
  1. **Schedule Telecon on Friday May 26 at 10am ET for 2 hours**.
     1. No Objection to add to schedule.
     2. Action item: Michael Montemurro to Schedule via 802.11 Reflector.
  2. **Editor Report** – Emily QI - 11-21/0687r15:
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0687-15-000m-802-11revme-editor-s-report.pptx>
     2. Review status of LB273.
     3. Doc 11-22/65r19 has all the Letter ballot comments from CC35, LB258, LB270 and LB273
     4. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-0065-19-000m-revme-wg-ballot-comments.xls>
     5. About 3000 comments included.
     6. **WG LB Comments** 
        1. All LB273 comments – 417
        2. All LB270 comments – 822
        3. All LB258 Comments – 1392
        4. All CC35 Comments – 604;
     7. Plan to roll in 802.11az, 802.11bd in August, and 802.11bc and 802.11bb after that.
     8. Current Comment Resolution status for LB273:

A picture containing text, screenshot, number, font

Description automatically generated

* 1. **Review Doc 11-23/0799 – Edward AU (Huawei)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0779-01-000m-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-lb273-comments-part-1.docx>
     2. Mark the following 19 ED2 CIDs: 4375, 4037, 4038, 4076, 4077, 4080, 4081, 4082, 4078, 4094, 4095, 4032, 4035, 4050, 4154, 4161, 4182, 4227, and 4316: Ready for Motion – Editorial Trivial Comments
     3. No Objection –
  2. **Review doc 11-23/0810r2 – Edward AU (Huawei)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0810-02-000m-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-lb273-comments-part-2.docx>
     2. Mark the following: 4056, 4057, 4058, 4059, 4060, 4061, 4062, 4063, 4264, 4295, 4298, 4173, 4183, 4258, 4308, 4346, 4354, 4110, 4120, 4121, 4394, 4041, 4135 to Ready for Motion – Editorial Trivial Comments
     3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Review doc 11-23/811r1 - Edward AU (Huawei)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0811-01-000m-proposed-resolution-for-miscellaneous-lb273-comments-part-3.docx>
     2. 23/0811r0: Relatively trivial: CIDs 4136, 4138, 4147, 4167, 4213, 4123, 4237, 4405, 4401 (ED1). Ready for Motion – Editorial Trivial Comments
     3. No objection
     4. CID 4142 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Discussion on how to address the Move Clause 13 to be a subclause of 13.
        3. Disagreement to making the change as an editorial change.
        4. Discussion on asking if this topic could be better served in SA Ballot.
        5. Proposed Resolution: Reject; FT included non-RSN version in Clause 13
        6. No Objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4176 and 4212 (ED2)
        1. Review comment
        2. Discussion of the direction of this resolution.
        3. May need a case by case to make any changes.
        4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4176: Rejected – Insufficient Details.
        5. Mark CID 4212 (ED2) as More Work Required; Assign to Mark RISON; Schedule for Mid-June Telecon.
     6. CID 4031 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Do we Need Equation numbers added to draft?
        3. What is the work required to add the equation number.
        4. Clause 28 equation references are in what form?
           1. Are they inline?
        5. Discussion on what the numbering may entail.
        6. From the SA Style Man: 15.2 Numbering of equations If the standard contains more than one equation, then equations of key importance should be numbered consecutively in parentheses at the right margin. Derivations of equations or examples where values are substituted for variables need not be numbered. An equation should be cited in the text by the word Equation and its number only [e.g., “see Equation (1)”]. If referring to two or more equations in the same sentence, each should be named separately. For example, use “see Equation (1), Equation (2), and Equation (3),” instead of “see Equations (1) through (3).” Equations in annexes should be numbered beginning with the letter of the annex where they are found. For example, the first equation in Annex B would be numbered “(B.1)” and the reference to it would be to “see Equation (B.1).”
        7. Only one equation in Clause 28 was numbered.
        8. References to equations is only needed in the referenced equation.
        9. Proposed Resolution: Reject; the equations that need to be numbered are already numbered.
        10. Publication editor may change it at publication.
        11. We could just change the 28-1 equation numbering and let the publication editor take care of it.
        12. Only one equation would need to be “unnumbered”.
        13. The question of the format of the Equation numbering and if the word “Equation” would need to be added as well to be like a “Table.”
        14. Desire to add to the list of items to be sent to Publication Editor.
        15. The Editors can discuss this in the Editor Meeting for future consideration of other amendments.
        16. Updated Proposed Resolution: Revised; At 4447.54, replace “as shown in Equation (28-1)” with “as follows:”. At 4447.57, delete “(28-1)”.
        17. Mark Ready for Motion
     7. CID 4178 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment
        2. There are reasons that the glyph is not the same for “minus” and “en dash”
        3. We can reject this for now for lack of details.
        4. If only search is detecting the difference, then maybe not a real issue.
        5. Sometimes a PDF view may not find something.
        6. Proposed Resolution: Rejected Insufficient details.
        7. Mark Ready for Motion
     8. CID 4138 (ED2)
        1. Missed “AND” and this needs to have the resolution include “AND”
        2. The updated resolution will be taken care of prior to motion.
        3. Already Marked Ready for Motion
     9. CID 4123 (ED2)
        1. Need to update the resolution to include deleting line 57 and 58.
        2. The updated resolution will be posted prior to the motion
  4. **Review doc 11-23/784 - CID 4000 4001 4002 4003 4004 4372 4394 –– Abhishek PATIL (Qualcomm)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-00-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx>
     2. CID 4000 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review Proposed Changes listed.
        3. Discussion on minor updates to be proposed to the text provided.
        4. Clarity changes were suggested.
        5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:23:48Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx> for CID 4000.;
        6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4001 (MAC)
        1. Review comment.
        2. Review proposed changes.
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. **CID 4002 (MAC)**
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review proposed changes.
        3. Discussion on changes on page 4.
        4. Proposed Resolution: Revise CID 4002 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:43:21Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx> for CID 4002, which splits the sentence and simplifies as suggested in the comment. In addition, the corresponding normative text is updated to clarify that procedure applies only when the Index Adjust TBTT Count field carries a nonzero value. Editorial clarifications to the 4th paragraph in 11.1.3.8.6.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     5. CID 4003 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review proposed changes.
        3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4003 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:49:45Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx> for CID 4003, which adds a new bullet as suggested by the comment. A bullet to cover buffered group address indication is also added (and the corresponding NOTE (3) is deleted). In addition, a few editorial updates were made along the way and a paragraph is added to the subclause to explain the behavior at the non-AP STA.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     6. CID 4004 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Review Proposed Changes
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     7. CID 4372 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review Proposed Changes
        3. Suggested minor changes.
        4. Further changes may be made later.
        5. Concern with keeping the changes as is, but there may be one that wanted a bit different set of changes, so requested to pull from motion on Thursday if required.
        6. Put this CID as a separate motion for consideration.
        7. Change the might text.
        8. Proposed Resolution: CID 4372 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:53:37Z): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:49:45Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx> for CID 4372.
        9. Make CID 4003 and CID 4372 included in the same motion.
  5. **Recess at 6:01pm.**

1. **TGme (REVme) Mixed-mode –Tuesday, May 16, 2023, at 016:00-18:00 ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 4:05pm ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of TG Officers present**:
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung) – Introduced late.
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei) – Joined late.
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Remember Registration** is required for this meeting and all the meetings this week as part of the 2023 May 802 Plenary.
   4. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
      1. No Issues noted.
   5. **Review Agenda: 11-23/0573r3:**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0573-03-000m-revme-agenda-may-2023-session.pptx>
      2. Monday May 15, 4pm ET
2. Chair’s Welcome, Policy & patent reminder
3. Approve Tuesday’s Agenda.
4. Comment Resolution
   1. Doc 11-23/0861 – CID 4381, 4382 –– Rui YANG (InterDigital)
   2. Doc 11-23/734 – CIDs 4015, 4016, 4017, 4018, 4019, 4020, 4021, 4022 Brian HART (Cisco)
   3. Doc 11-21/727r23 – CID 4272, 4294, 4300, 4310, 4332 – RISON (Samsung)
5. Time Specific Agenda Topic: @5pm – Discuss WUR MC-OOK Issue: doc 11-23/761: CIDs 4400, 4370, 4116, 4055, 4065, 4370, 4116, 4055
6. Recess
   * 1. No Objection to Proposed Agenda
   1. Doc 11-23/0861 - CID 4381, 4382 –– Rui YANG (InterDigital)
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0861-00-000m-cr-for-lb273-cid-4381-and-4382.docx>
      2. CID 4381 (ED1) and 4382 (ED2)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Review proposed Changes.
         3. Suggesting that “BSS Operating Channel”
         4. Others said that BSS Channel is used in many places.
         5. Change BSS bandwidth to “BSS Channel” is wrong, but rather leave as “BSS bandwidth” is fine.
         6. Straw Poll: Resolve the CID by Replacing BSS bandwidth with
            1. BSS bandwidth
            2. BSS Operating channel
            3. BSS Operating channel width
            4. BSS channel
            5. Straw Poll Results: 8/6/5/1
         7. Preference to reject.
         8. Proposed Resolution: Reject. Rejected. The term BSS channel might be confused with the Primary 20 MHz channel number.  And the term BSS bandwidth is used extensively in the standard.
         9. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
   2. **Doc 11-23/734 – CIDs 4015, 4016, 4017, 4018, 4019, 4020, 4021, 4022 Brian HART (Cisco)**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0734-03-000m-afc-fixes.docx>
      2. CID 4015 (PHY)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Discussion on regulatory issues that are causing a concern.
         3. Discussion on combining Indoor capable with SP capable. Or keeping them separate.
         4. Discussion on how the table should be crafted.
         5. Mark This CID as More Work Required
         6. Assign to Brian Hart
         7. Schedule to First Telecon in June.
         8. Also Assign CID 4012 to Brian Hart same Status and Schedule as 4015.
      3. CID 4019 (PHY)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Review proposed changes.
         3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4019 (PHY): Revised. Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0734r3 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0734-01-000m-afc-fixes.docx>) for CID 4019.
         4. No objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
      4. CID 4020 (PHY)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Review Changes being suggested.
         3. Discussion on how to define the value in Regulatory subfield.
         4. Discussion on Operating Classes – at 6Ghz, rules say use global class value.
         5. Mark This CID as More Work Required
         6. Assign to Brian Hart
         7. Schedule to First Telecon in June.
   3. **Time Specific Agenda Topic: @5pm – Discuss WUR MC-OOK Issue**
      1. CIDs 4400, 4370, 4055, 4065, 4370, 4116, 4055 – doc 11-23/761
      2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0761-01-000m-proposed-tgme-resolution-for-use-of-wur-ook-modulation-and-mc-ook-text-in-d3-0.docx>
      3. Review introduction of the submission.
      4. CIDs 4400 (MAC), 4370 (PHY), 4055 (MAC):
         1. Discussion on changes.
         2. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 4400 (MAC), 4370 (PHY), 4055 (MAC): Revised. Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0761-02-000m-proposed-tgme-resolution-for-use-of-wur-ook-modulation-and-mc-ook-text-in-d3-0.docx>
         3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
   4. **PHY CIDS CID 4116 –** Mark RISON (Samsung)
      1. Review comment based on the WUR MC-OOK discussion.
      2. CID 4116 (PHY)
         1. Review the PICs for CFWUR
         2. Discussion on the use of OFDM being marked mandatory vs optional.
         3. (CFWUR AND not CFAP):O (CFWUR and CFAP):M
         4. Agreement to updated PICs.
         5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (PHY: 2023-05-16 21:32:49Z) - Change "CFWUR:M" to "(CFWUR AND NOT CFAP):O (CFWUR AND CFAP):M".
         6. Mark Ready for motion and move it (CID 4116) to MAC
   5. **Adjust the Agenda to have CID 4022 now and the others in Brian’s Doc will be scheduled for June Telecon.**
      * 1. **CIDs 4016, 4017, 4018, 4021 (PHY)** Mark these CIDs as More Work Required
        2. Assign them to Brian HART
        3. Schedule them to the First Telecon in June
   6. **Review Doc 11-23/734r4 –4022 Brian HART (Cisco)**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0734-04-000m-afc-fixes.docx>
      2. CID 4022 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Review Proposed Changes.
         3. Discussion on the ordering that is being described.
         4. Mark this CID as More Work Required
         5. Assign them to Brian Hart
         6. Schedule them to the First Telecon in June
   7. **Doc 11-21/727r23 –** CID 4202, 4206, 4272, 4294, 4300, 4310, 4332 – RISON (Samsung)
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-23-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>
      2. CID 4202 (PHY)
         1. Review Comment
         2. Review Context in Figure (27-61).
         3. The Editors have been consulted already on the proposed change.
         4. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
         5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4206 (PHY)
       1. Review comment
       2. Review Context on page 3472
       3. Concern with how many locations need to be changed.
       4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4206 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-16 21:53:06Z)
       5. Mark Ready for Motion
       6. ACTION ITEM #2: Mark RISON to double-check with Dave HALASZ, off-line, that we do not need to make the whole paragraph part of bullet 3)
    2. CID 4243 (GEN)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Discussion on proposed changes.
       3. Jon had a proposed resolution, but more changes need to be considered on the definitions on p209.19 and p209.21 – definition needs to be rewritten. Identify the fields that the KEK is encrypting and the specific frame.
       4. Assign to Jon Rosdahl
       5. Mark More Work Required
       6. Schedule for June Telecon.
  1. **Recess at 6:03pm**

1. **TGme (REVme) Mixed-mode –Wednesday, May 17, 2023, at 010:30-12:30 ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 10:35pm ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of TG Officers present**:
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Remember Registration** is required for this meeting and all the meetings this week as part of the 2023 May 802 Plenary.
   4. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
      1. No Issues noted.
   5. **Review Agenda: 11-23/0573r4:**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0573-04-000m-revme-agenda-may-2023-session.pptx>
      2. Request to Revisit CID 4206
      3. Set 10 Minutes for Emily to go through CID 4028
      4. No objection to the Updated Proposed Agenda.

* 1. **Review Doc 11-23/784r1** – Abhi PATEL (Qualcomm)
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx>
     2. CID 4394 (ED2)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
        3. No objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4000 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4000 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-15 21:23:48Z): Incorporate the changes shown in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0784-01-000m-lb273-resolution-for-cids-assigned-to-abhi.docx> for CID 4000.
        3. No objection -- Mark Ready for Motion
  2. **Doc 11-21/727r23 –4206, 4251, 4272, 4294, 4300, 4310, 4332 – RISON (Samsung)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-23-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>
     2. CID 4206 (MAC)
        1. Revisit
        2. Updated Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 14:57:31Z): Make the entire para at the referenced location be list item 3)
        3. No objection – Keep Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4251 (MAC)
        1. Review comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4251 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-17 14:58:45Z)
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion

* + 1. CID 4272 (GEN)
       1. Review comment
       2. Discussion on the use of the need to for a “NOTE” and if it could have a “should” vs “ought”
       3. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-05-17 15:02:45Z)
       4. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    2. CID 4294 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
       3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* 1. **Review doc: 11-23/0856r0 – CID 4028, Emily QI (Intel)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0856-00-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4028.docx>
     2. CID 4028 (MAC)
        1. Review comment history.
        2. Updated Submission is being used as this topic was tried last March, but needed more work. See doc 11-23-0313.
        3. Review Proposed Changes to be made regarding “11.21.15 Channel Usage procedures and other clauses.
        4. Discussion on the implications of the changes to devices. What happens if the device does not understand the Usage Mode field value?
        5. Remove last sentence of the middle paragraph on page 3.
        6. Changes will be made and posted to R2,
        7. Assign to Emily QI
        8. Mark More Work Required
        9. Schedule for May 26, 2023
  2. **Review doc 11-23/829r0 –S1G comments CID 4391 and 4392 (MAC)–– Dave HALASZ (Morse Micro)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0829-00-000m-cids-4391-4392.docx>
     2. CID 4391 and 4392 (MAC)
     3. Review comments
     4. Review Proposed Changes.
     5. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 4391 and 4392 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 15:25:44Z): Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0829-01-000m-cids-4391-4392.docx>.
     6. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion.

* 1. **Review doc 11-23/0853r0 - Dave HALASZ (Morse Micro)**
  2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0853-00-000m-cid-4280.docx>
     1. CID 4280 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4280 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 15:27:51Z): Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0853-00-000m-cid-4280.docx>.
        3. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  3. **Revisit Doc 11-23/0856r1 – CID 4028 - Emily QI**
     1. Review updates since we reviewed just minutes ago.
     2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4028 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 15:16:29Z): Incorporate the changes in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0856-01-000m-proposed-resolution-for-cid-4028.docx>, which adds such a facility, for noninfrastructure BSSs.
     3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
  4. **Review doc 11-23/881 – CID 4047 and 4048 (MAC) Sean Coffey (Realtek)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0881-00-000m-revme-lb270-cr-for-4047-4048.docx>
     2. CID 4047 (MAC)
        1. Review Comments
        2. Discussion on the using a limitation to just this clause.
        3. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 15:39:25Z): Insert at the start of this sentence, "For purposes of EDMG operation,"
        4. Discussion on if this is on EDMG or DMG, but EDMG is an extension of DMG, so Saying DMG should be correct, but EDMG is more correct.
        5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
     3. CID 4048 (MAC)
        1. Review Comments
        2. Review Submission discussion.
        3. Presentation of submission.
        4. Mark More Work Required
        5. Assign to Sean Coffey
        6. Schedule for a Telecon in June.
  5. **Review GEN CIDS** – Jon ROSDAHL
     1. Use Database – Follow along with doc:
        1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-01-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>
     2. CID 4374 (GEN)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: REJECTED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:05:43Z) REJECTED - Thanks for the compliment. No change requested; No Change made due to this comment.
        3. Mark Ready for Motion
     3. CID 4376 (GEN):
        1. Review Comment
        2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:11:44Z) change "being to” to "being references to"
        3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
     4. CID 4379 (GEN):
        1. Review Comment.
        2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:15:38Z) Change 5941 to 5491 at the following 6 locations:

177.34, 951.40, 952.10, 952.24, 952.52, 952.55

Also reorder the IETF RFCs accordingly on Page 177.

Change the Date for IETF RFC 5491 to 2009 on page 177.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    1. CID 4180 (GEN):
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:18:49Z)
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    2. CID 4097 (GEN):
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:21:41Z) Change the definition of DTIM Beacon to ""A special case for a Beacon frame or S1G Beacon frame, where the DTIM Count field in the TIM element is equal to zero. A DTIM beacon might be followed by buffered group addressed bufferable units (BUs)."
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
    3. CID 4104 (GEN):
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:22:42Z) Note to Editor add to Clause 3.2.
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    4. CID 4119 (GEN):
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:26:49Z) Insert a NOTE below the lettered list, "NOTE--A non-mobility based transition from a BSS to the same BSS (same AP or PCP) is also supported. See 11.3.5.4.
       3. "No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
    5. CID 4252 (GEN):
       1. Review Comment
       2. Proposed Resolution: ACCEPTED (GEN: 2023-05-17 16:28:58Z)
       3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  1. Recessed 12:29 pm ET

1. **TGme (REVme) Mixed-mode – Wednesday, May 17, 2023, at 016:00-18:00 ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 4:08pm ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of TG Officers present**:
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung)
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Remember Registration** is required for this meeting and all the meetings this week as part of the 2023 May 802 Plenary.
   4. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
      1. No Issues noted.
   5. **Review Agenda: 11-23/0573r5:**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0573-05-000m-revme-agenda-may-2023-session.pptx>
      2. No Objection to proposed Agenda in 11-23/0573r5.
   6. **Review doc 11-23/0537r3 -** Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0537-03-000m-reassociating-sta-recognition.docx>
      2. CID 4069 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment.
         2. Presentation of the discussion of the Submission.
         3. Discussion of “enabled” is this a capability or something else.
         4. Discussion on 11.3.5.3 and password identifier.
         5. Discussion on Beacon Protection.
         6. Review Option 1 and Option 2.
         7. If there is agreement, we don't need option 2, we can drop it and simplify this discussion.
         8. The Chair requested that the presenter start a reflector discussion and bring this back on a June telecon.
         9. For now, we'll focus on option 1b.
         10. AdHoc Notes: MAC: 2023-05-17 20:41:11Z - More work required.  Bring back on a June telecon.
         11. Some would like to consider option 2, also.
         12. Will discuss on the reflector.
   7. **Review doc 11-23/0858r1 - Jouni MALINEN (Qualcomm)**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-01-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>
      2. CID 4064 (MAC)
         1. Review Comment
         2. The issue is endian-ness of the Length field in the Basic A-MSDU subframe format.
         3. Noted the difference between the Basic A-MSDU subframe which says use the same bits as IEEE 802.3, versus the Mesh A-MSDU subframe format.
         4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4064 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 20:53:00Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-01-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4064.
         5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
      3. CID 4066 (MAC)
         1. Review comment
         2. Review the discussion in the submission.
         3. There was a Q in 9.4.5.1 that should be an S.
         4. Concern that the change would make the ability to tell which version of the capability is being used.
         5. Discussion on what the understanding of either a no response or a negative response.
         6. Discussion on the need or lack of need to indicate Table 9-412 in 9.4.5.1.
         7. Updated the note a well.
         8. Proposed Resolution: CID 4066 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 21:06:48Z): Incorporate the changes in 11-23/0858r1 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-01-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>) for CID 4066.
         9. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion

* + 1. CID 4067 (SEC)
       1. Review Comment.
       2. Review Discussion and proposed changes outlined in the submission.
       3. Discussion on including “if present”. (page 8).
       4. Updates made to the Proposed resolution.
       5. Proposed Resolution: REVISED (SEC: 2023-05-17 21:24:45Z) - Add the following paragraph after the first paragraph of 6.4 at P364 L62: ‘The Protected parameter is of Boolean type. If true or not present, this specifies that a Protected Dual of a Public Action frame is used; otherwise, a Public Action frame is used. The presence of the Protected parameter is indicated in the Comments column of Table 6-1.’

Add ‘Includes the Protected parameter.’ into the Comments column of Table 6-1 for the following rows: MLME-VSPECIFIC, MLME-EXTCHANNELSWITCH, MLME-DSETPC, MLME-ENABLEMENT, MLME-DEENABLEMENT, MLME-GAS, MLME-QLOAD, MLME-TXOPADVERTISEMENT, MLME-QAB, MLME-CHANNELAVAILABILITYQUERY, MLME-CHANNELSCHEDULEMANAGEMENT, MLME-CVS, MLME-GDDENABLEMENT, MLME-NETWORKCHANNELCONTROL.

* + - 1. No Objection – Mark Ready for motion
  1. **Review doc 11-23/0044r8 SAE Protected Password Identifiers – Dan HARKINS (HPE)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0044-07-000m-hpke-protected-password-identifiers.docx>
     2. CID 4026 and 4072 (SEC)
        1. Review the status of the proposal.
        2. Request to the previous “No” voters to review the updated proposal and see if they can support the updated proposal.
        3. Discussion on the need to have the public key being included in the beacons.
        4. To many open items were identified that keep the no voters from joining the current revision of the proposal.
        5. Discussion on how this proposal solves the enterprise use case in a generic way for the less sophisticated user.
        6. The need to find a simple solution is being debated and each side believes their solution is the easier path.
        7. Discussion on why enterprise version is needed for simple use case.
        8. More work Required.
        9. Assign to Dan Harkins
        10. Schedule for June Telecon
  2. **Review doc 11-23/0870r1 – Channel Switching – Jouhan KIM (Qualcomm)**
     1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0870-01-000m-inter-band-channel-switch-using-ecs.docx>
     2. CID 4410 (MAC)
        1. Review Comment
        2. REVme D3.0 added sentence prohibiting the use of ECS for inter-band channel switching.
        3. See CID3176 from LB270 for details.
        4. Proposed change “Delete “ECS procedures shall not be used to switch between bands.”
        5. Straw Poll: Resolve CID 4410 as Accepted.
           1. Yes/No/Abstain
           2. Result: 13/2/2
        6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4410 (MAC): ACCEPTED (MAC: 2023-05-17 21:55:30Z). Run motion on "MAC motion CID 4410" tab.
        7. Mark as Ready for Motion
        8. Run as a separate motion.
  3. **PHY CIDS – Mark RISON (Samsung)**
     1. CID 4395 (PHY)
        1. Review Comment
        2. Review context
        3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
        4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
  4. **Recess at 6:00pm**

1. **TGme (REVme) Mixed-mode –Thursday, May 18, 2023, at 016:00-18:00 ET.**
   1. **Called to order** 4:04pm ET by the TG Chair, Michael MONTEMURRO (Huawei).
   2. **Introductions of TG Officers present**:
      1. Vice Chair - Mark HAMILTON (Ruckus/CommScope)
      2. Vice Chair - Mark RISON (Samsung) – Was Online but did not introduce at start.
      3. Editor - Emily QI (Intel)
      4. Editor – Edward AU (Huawei)
      5. Secretary - Jon ROSDAHL (Qualcomm)
   3. **Remember Registration** is required for this meeting and all the meetings this week as part of the 2023 May 802 Plenary.
   4. **Review Patent Policy and Copyright policy and Participation Policies.**
      1. No Issues noted.
   5. **Review Agenda: 11-23/0573r6:**
      1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0573-06-000m-revme-agenda-may-2023-session.pptx>
      2. No objection to the agenda.
   6. **Motions**
      1. doc 11-23/24r6 - slides 17 through 20
         1. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0024-06-000m-revme-motions.pptx>
      2. **Motion 106 – EDITOR1, EDITOR2 CIDs (2023-05-18)**
         1. Discussion on CID 4401,
            1. CID 4401 Resolution should be [Q]m,n indicates the element in row m and column n of matrix \*Q\*, where 1 ≤ m ≤ Nrow and 1 ≤ n ≤ Ncol, with Nrow and Ncol being the number of rows and columns of \*\*\*delete the\*\*\* matrix Q, respectively.
         2. Updated Motion:
         3. **Approve the comment resolutions in the**

“Trivial Editorial Comments” (27 CIDs) in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0834-01-000m-revme-wg-lb273-editor1-ad-hoc-comments.xlsx>,

“Motion ED2-273-01” (5 CIDs) and “Motion ED2-273-02” (51 CIDs) in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0778-02-000m-revme-editor2-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>, for CID 4401, add an editing instruction “[Q]m,n indicates the element in row m and column n of matrix \*Q\*, where 1 ≤ m ≤ Nrow and 1 ≤ n ≤ Ncol, with Nrow and Ncol being the number of rows and columns of \*\*\*delete the\*\*\* matrix Q, respectively.” **and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.**

* + - 1. Moved: Edward Au
      2. Seconded: Emily QI
      3. **Results Motion #106:** No objection – Unanimous Consent
    1. **Motion 107 – GEN, MAC, PHY, SEC CIDs (2023-05-18)**
       1. **Approve the comment resolutions in the**

"GEN Motion Orlando" (9 CIDs) in 11-23/840r2: (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0840-02-000m-revme-gen-ad-hoc-comments-on-lb273.xlsx>),

“Motion MAC-BE” tabs (13 CIDs) in 11-21/0793r39: (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-39-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>),

updating the document reference in the resolution of CID 4064 to 11-23/0858r4: (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0858-04-000m-various-lb273-comments.docx>),

Change resolution of CID 4047 to be: “REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-17 15:39:25Z): Insert at the start of this sentence, "For the purposes of EDMG operation,"”

“PHY Motion R” tab (3 CIDs) in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0727-24-000m-revme-phy-comments.xls>, resolving CID 4019 as “REVISED; Change the beginning of 3rd paragraph of E.2.7.6 to "The Regulatory Info subfield in the Control field of the 6 GHz Operation Information field of the HE Operation element (#4019)expresses the current operational mode of the AP and is interpreted”"

“Security Motion A” tab (2 CID) in <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/22/11-22-2020-03-000m-revme-lb270-sec-adhoc-comments.xlsx>

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Jon ROSDAHL
      2. Seconded: Stephen MCCANN
      3. **Results Motion #107:** No Objection – Unanimous Consent – Motion Passes.

* + 1. **Motion 108 – CID 4410 (MAC) (2023-05-18)**
       1. Approve the comment resolution for CID 4410 on the “MAC motion CID 4410” tab of in 11-21/293r39 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-39-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>) and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.
       2. Moved: Stephen MCCANN
       3. Seconded: Youhan KIM
       4. **Results Motion #108:** Approved with one No Vote – Motion passes.

* + 1. **Motion 109 – CID 4372 and 4003 (MAC) (2023-05-18)**
       1. Approve the comment resolution for CID 4410 on the “MAC motion CIDs 4372 and 4003” tab of in 11-21/0793r39 (<https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-39-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>),

and incorporate the text changes into the TGme draft.

* + - 1. Moved: Abi PATIL
      2. Seconded: Edward AU
      3. Results Motion #108: No objection – Unanimous Consent – Motion Approved
    1. Webex had 25 connected.
  1. **Return to Comment Resolution**
  2. **CID 4300, 4310, 4332** – RISON (Samsung)
     1. Defer until Mark RISON can get connected to WebEx again.
  3. **MAC Discuss/Review** comments – HAMILTON (Ruckus/Commscope)
     + 1. 11-21-0793r39:
       2. <https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/21/11-21-0793-39-000m-revme-mac-comments.xls>
       3. CID 4162 (MAC)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Push comment to the AdHoc notes with White space to better read comment.
          3. The Editors discussed if the instructions were sufficient. Edward said to assign it to him for making the edits.
          4. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
          5. No objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       4. CID 4222 (MAC)
          1. Review comment
          2. Discussion on whether STAs is plural or BSSIDs is to be plural, or BSS is to be plural. And then what possessive is needed. "Receiving STAs' BSSs' BSSIDs"
          3. Discuss the correct resolution.
          4. Proposed Resolution: CID 4222 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-18 20:50:46Z) - Change to "matches all receiving STAs' BSSs' BSSIDs".  At 2347.13 change "AP's BSSID" to "AP's BSS's BSSID"
          5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       5. CID 4355 (MAC)
          1. Review comment
          2. Discussion on Table 9-78 Status Codes meaning.
          3. Rather than Success or Failure.
          4. Change the two paragraphs to “The Status Code is used in a response Management Frame to indicate the status of a requested operation. The Status Code field is shown in Figure 9-139 (Status Code Field Format). The values of the Status Code field are defined in Table 9-78 (Status Codes).”
          5. Proposed Resolution. CID 4355 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-18 20:53:25Z): Replace the first two paragraphs with: "The Status Code field is used in a response Management frame to indicate the status of a requested operation. The Status Code field is shown in Figure 9-139 (Status Code field format). The values of the Status Code field are defined in Table 9-78 (Status codes)."
          6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       6. CID 4204 (MAC)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Review Context
          3. Proposed Resolution: CID 4204 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-18 21:09:07Z): Change the cited text to "The Block Ack Policy subfield is set to 1 for a non-DMG STA.".  In Table 11-8 change "set" to "equal" (4x)
          4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       7. CID 4320 (MAC)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Review Context
          3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
          4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       8. CID 4390 (MAC)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Review Context
          3. The 101 did get assigned, and the reserved row needs to be updated.
          4. Proposed Resolution: Accepted
          5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       9. CID 4101 (MAC)
          1. Review Comment
          2. Review Context
          3. Add the HE Clause to the list of PHY Clauses.
          4. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
          5. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       10. CID 4146 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Question on why we would exclude the “current operating class”?
           3. Review Figure 9-427 – Current Operating Class field.
           4. Discussion on P1045.14 sentence meaning.
           5. Some concern that no change was needed.
           6. Proposed Resolution: CID 4146 (MAC): REJECTED (MAC: 2023-05-18 21:19:34Z): The currently configured operating class must, by definition, be in the list of operating classes within which the STA is currently configured to operate.
           7. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
       11. CID 4014 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Proposed Resolution: CID 4014 (MAC): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-18 21:23:13Z): Change to "Indicates the maximum MPDU length that the STA is capable of receiving (see 10.11 (A-MSDU operation)) **, excluding an HE Compressed Beamforming/CQI Report frame (see 26.7.1 (General))**"
           3. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion.
       12. CID 4363 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Review Context
           3. Similar CIDs 4362 and 4364 both in ED1.
           4. Same Resolution for all 3 CIDs.
           5. Proposed Resolution: CIDs 4362 (ED1), 4363 (MAC), 4364 (ED1): REVISED (MAC: 2023-05-18 21:27:23Z): In the Encoding column, replace "MaximumA -PPDUULenghtExponent" with "Maximum AMPDU Length Exponent".
           6. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       13. CID 4380 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Review Context.
           3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
           4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       14. CID 4194 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Review Context
           3. Proposed Resolution: Accepted.
           4. No Objection – Mark Ready for Motion
       15. CID 4214 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment.
           2. Review Context.
           3. Discussion on if subclause 9.6.5 needed to be updated/changed to “Vendor Specific and Vendor Specific Protected Frame Details.
           4. There is a similar CID 4065 that may conflict with this CID.
           5. Move CID 4214 (MAC) to GEN and reconcile the changes for both CIDs.
           6. Assign to Jouni MALINEN
           7. Mark More Work Required
           8. Schedule for June Telecon
       16. CID 4070 (MAC)
           1. Mark Submission Required.
           2. Assigned to Jouni MALINEN. Will take up later.
       17. CID 4179 (MAC)
           1. Review Comment
           2. Review Contexts.
           3. Mark RISON has this CID in his document and has a discussion on the various locations.
           4. Will let this go for now and come back later.
  4. **Teleconferences, Adhoc, Plans for July**
     1. Teleconferences 10am for 2 hours:
        1. Friday May 26 (discussed earlier in the week)
        2. Friday June 2, 16, 23
        3. Monday June 12, 19, 26
        4. June 23 is midsummer Holiday (Jon is not available either). No SEC comments that day.
        5. June 19 is also concerning.
        6. June 16 is plan for Motions – Editors agreed to the day.
     2. AdHoc plans:
        1. Not able to find available date in June.
        2. Possibility of AdHoc in Aug would be decided in July.
     3. Plans for July
        1. Try for 5 Slots.
        2. Try to avoid Thursday Afternoon if possible.
        3. Look for sponsor for AdHoc to be held first 2 weeks in Oct.
  5. **Adjourn at 5:59pm**

**References:**