### **IEEE P802.11Wireless LANs**

|  |
| --- |
| CC36 CR for Trigger frame on User Info field |
| Date: 2021-09-01 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | Email |
| Yanjun Sun | Qualcomm |  |  |  |
| Steve Shellhammer |  |  |  |  |
| Alfred Asterjadhi |  |  |  |  |
| George Cherian |  |  |  |  |
| Abhishek Patil |  |  |  |  |
| Youhan Kim |  |  |  |  |
| Bin Tian |  |  |  |  |
| Duncan Ho |  |  |  |  |
| Gaurang Naik |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

**Abstract**

This submission proposes resolutions for following 18 comments received for TGbe CC36:

* 4879,7740,5117,6695,4342,7684,7685,7686,8073,6932,5510,6696,5202,7896,4322,4343,7687,4323

**Revisions:**

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

***TGbe editor: Please note Baseline is REVmd D5.0, 11ax D8.0, and 11be D1.1***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| CID | Commenter | Clause | Page | Comment | Proposed Change | Resolution |
| 4879 | Dong Guk Lim | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.01 | it is not clear what is user info list field. since it just means all user info fields in the trigger frame, it seems does not need. Delete the user info list field and change the subclause's name " User Info List field" with " User Info field" | As in comment | RejectedThe User Info List field contains the list of User Info fields. We can represent it as either a list (simpler and compact) or add zero or more User info fields to the figure (longer). Preference is to keep as is (simpler and compact). Also because this is how it was defined in 11ax.  |
| 7740 | Xiaogang Chen | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.01 | what's a "user info list field"? It doesn't shown in the trigger frame format. | as commented | RejectedThe User Info List field contains the list of User Info fields. It does show in the Trigger frame format as defined in 11ax. Please refer to Figure 9-64a (Trigger frame format). |
| 5117 | Geonjung Ko | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.14 | Missing hyphen between "MU" and "BAR" | Add hyphen | RevisedThe typo has been fixed as suggested.Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #5117 |
| 6695 | Rojan Chitrakar | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.13 | All User Info fields in the User Info List field of a Trigger frame have the same length unless the Trigger frame is an MU BAR Trigger frame (see 9.3.1.22.4 (MU-BAR Trigger frame format) and 9.3.1.22.1.3 (Special User Info field)). The sentence can be made more clear. | Rephrase as: "All User Info fields in the User Info List field of a Trigger frame have the same length unless the Trigger frame is an MU BAR Trigger frame (see 9.3.1.22.4 (MU-BAR Trigger frame format)) or a User Info field is a Special User Info field (see 9.3.1.22.1.3 (Special User Info field))." | RevisedAgree with the commenter the current text needs more clarification.The current text is correct and based on the following text in D1.1. The intention is to emphasize that a Special User Info field has the same length with other User Info field in most cases.“The presence and length of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield in the Special User Info field depends on the variant of the Trigger frame. When present, the length and the subfields of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield are as follows:— The length is one octet and all the subfields are reserved in a Basic Trigger frame and in a BFRP Trigger frame.— The length is four octets and all the subfields, except for the BAR Type subfield, are reserved in an MU-BAR Trigger frame and a GCR MU-BAR Trigger frame. The BAR Type subfield is set to indicate a Compressed BAR in an MU BAR Trigger frame and is set to indicate a GCR BAR in a GCR MU BAR Trigger frame.”Added the following NOTE to clarify the intention:“NOTE—one of the User Info fields can be a Special User Info field”Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #6695 |
| 4342 | Arik Klein | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.13 | Incomplete sentence - please correct as proposed | Revise the sentence as follows:"All User Info fields in the User Info List field of a Trigger frame have the same length unless the Trigger frame is an MU BAR Trigger frame (see 9.3.1.22.4 (MU-BAR Trigger frame format) \*or the User Info field is a Special User Info field (See\* 9.3.1.22.1.3 (Special User Info field)). | RevisedAgree with the commenter the current text needs more clarification.The current text is correct and based on the following text in D1.1. The intention is to emphasize that a Special User Info field has the same length with other User Info field in most cases.“The presence and length of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield in the Special User Info field depends on the variant of the Trigger frame. When present, the length and the subfields of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield are as follows:— The length is one octet and all the subfields are reserved in a Basic Trigger frame and in a BFRP Trigger frame.— The length is four octets and all the subfields, except for the BAR Type subfield, are reserved in an MU-BAR Trigger frame and a GCR MU-BAR Trigger frame. The BAR Type subfield is set to indicate a Compressed BAR in an MU BAR Trigger frame and is set to indicate a GCR BAR in a GCR MU BAR Trigger frame.”Added the following NOTE to clarify the intention:“NOTE—one of the User Info fields can be a Special User Info field”Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #6695 |
| 7684 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.13 | This sentence does not make sense and some parts seem to be missing, and needs to be rewritten. | please rewrite the sentence. It does not make sense right now. | RevisedAgree with the commenter the current text needs more clarification.The current text is correct and based on the following text in D1.1. The intention is to emphasize that a Special User Info field has the same length with other User Info field in most cases.“The presence and length of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield in the Special User Info field depends on the variant of the Trigger frame. When present, the length and the subfields of the Trigger Dependent User Info subfield are as follows:— The length is one octet and all the subfields are reserved in a Basic Trigger frame and in a BFRP Trigger frame.— The length is four octets and all the subfields, except for the BAR Type subfield, are reserved in an MU-BAR Trigger frame and a GCR MU-BAR Trigger frame. The BAR Type subfield is set to indicate a Compressed BAR in an MU BAR Trigger frame and is set to indicate a GCR BAR in a GCR MU BAR Trigger frame.”Added the following NOTE to clarify the intention:“NOTE—one of the User Info fields can be a Special User Info field”Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #6695 |
| 7685 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.21 | If B39 is used to indicate that the User Info field is an HE variant (as said in the previous sentence), then B39 is not reserved. | remove "reserved and" from the cited sentence | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleRevised the text to clarify that it’s only reserved for non-EHT HE STA and is not reserved any more for an EHT STA.Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #7685 |
| 7686 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.25 | Since this subclause is on User Info field, it is not very clear what "the presence of the special user info" means, presence of the special user info in an User Info subfield? Please indicate clearly that it is indication for the presence of Special User Info subfield in the trigger frame in both the text and the Table. In addition, is an EHT non-AP STA supposed to search for Special User Info field after reading its own User Info field? The procedure step is not very clear why an indication of the presence of a special user info subfield in the trigger frame is included in each individual User Info subfield; this is strange particularly since there is already a Special User Info present bit in the Common Info. Consider to remove the Special User Info column from the table. or at least move the information out of the subclause for User Info subfield. | as in comment | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleRevised the text to “the presence of the Special User Info in the Trigger frame” in the subclause as suggested.Clarifications for the commenter: the special User Info field (if present) is placed immediately after the Common Info field, so a receiver could find it before locating the User Info field addressed to the receiver. The ‘presence of the Special User Info in the Trigger frame’ is called out explicitly in the existing text to provide clarity on the STA behavior if the AP doesn’t correctly set B55 in the Common Info field or include the Special User Info in the Trigger frame. Such clarity helps avoid ambiguity in implementations. Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #7686 |
| 8073 | yujin noh | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.30 | delete the column of Presnece of Special User Info field which is redundent because B55 indicates whether Special User Info Field is Present or not | as in comment | RejectedThe ‘presence of the Special User Info in the Trigger frame’ is called out explicitly in the existing text to provide clarity on the STA behavior if the AP doesn’t correctly set B55 in the Common Info field or include the Special User Info in the Trigger frame. Such clarity helps avoid ambiguity in implementations.  |
| 6932 | Saju Palayur | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.31 | Does the column title "Presence of Special User Info field" in Table 9-29g1 indicate the presence of any Special User Info field or just the 2007 ? | please indicate | RejectedThis is a question instead of comment.Clarifications for the commenter: There is only one Special User Info field defined. Its presence can be identified by B55 in the Common Info field (0), its AID12 value (2007) and its location (immediately after the Common Info). 1486r1 |
| 5510 | Jinsoo Choi | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.30 | What about other combinations regarding setting of B54, B55 in Common info field and B39 in User info field in Table 9-29g1? There are a few more possible combinations and some is even not able to be supported based on the agreement. It would be better to clarify if some combinations are reserved, not defined, or not applicable with possible combinations in the next version of draft. | As in comment | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleAdded the following note below the table:“a non-AP EHT STA does not respond with a TB PPDU to a Trigger frame that includes a combination not listed in Table 9-29g1 (see 35.4.2.3.3 (Conditions for not responding with an TB PPDU)). ”Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #5510 |
| 6696 | Rojan Chitrakar | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.46 | What's the purpose of the last row? Why is B55 set to 0 (i.e., Special User Info field is present) when HE TB PPDU is solicited? If this is meant for R2, it should be clarified as such. | Explain the meaning/purpose of the last row of the table. | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principle and added a NOTE as follows: “the last row in Table 9-29g1 allows an non-AP EHT STA to transmit an HE TB PPDU in the primary 160 MHz as a response to a Trigger frame even if the Trigger frame contains a Special User Info field”Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #6696 |
| 5202 | Hanqing Lou | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.50 | Table 9-29g1 is good for R1. Do we want to add restriction of R1 STA in the sentence "An EHT STA shall not transmit an EHT TB PPDU if the B55 of the Common Info field is set to 1."? | Change to "An EHT STA with dot11EHTBaseLineFeaturesImplementedOnly shall not transmit an EHT TB PPDU if the B55 of the Common Info field is set to 1." | RevisedAdded a NOTE to the table 9-29g1. Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #5510 |
| 7896 | Yoshio Urabe | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.50 | "An EHT STA shall not transmit an EHT TB PPDU if the B55 of the Common Info field is set to 1." is a behavioral description. | Move this sentense to 35.4.2.3 (Non-AP STA behavior for UL MU operation). | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleCopied the normative text to 5.4.2.3 as suggested and deleted the current text.Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #7896 |
| 4322 | Arik Klein | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.52 | Please clarify to which Trigger frame variant the following sentence refers:"An EHT AP with dot11EHTBaseLineFeaturesImplementedOnly equal to true does not set B54 in the Common Info field to 1 and B55 in the Common Info field to 0 in a Trigger frame": HE variant / EHT variant / both? | As in comment | RejectedClarification for the commenter: the intention of the text is to say that an R1 EHT AP can only use the combinations in the first 3 rows in Table 9-29g1 in a Trigger frame. The first row is to trigger HE TB PPDU. The second or third row is to trigger EHT TB PPDU. There is no HE or EHT variant Trigger frame defined. Instead, HE or EHT variant User Info field has been used in this subclause to cover various cases. |
| 4343 | Arik Klein | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.52 | Add "s" after the word "equal" in the following sentence:" An EHT AP with dot11EHTBaseLineFeaturesImplementedOnly equal to true ..." | As in comment | Rejected‘equal to’ is commonly used in the baseline text. |
| 7687 | Xiaofei Wang | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.52 | Please clarify the meaning of the sentence. It is currently unclear and confusing. Is only the combination "B54=1 B55=0" not allowed? Or are all combinations in which "B54=1" or "B55=0" not allowed? | the sentence is not clear. Please clarify | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleRevised the text for clarification. The intention is to disallow an R1 AP from using the combinations in the last two rows in Table 9-29g1. Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r11486r1 tagged as #7687 |
| 4323 | Arik Klein | 9.3.1.22.1.2 | 90.54 | Add clarification that the Trogger frame is of EHT variant | Revise the sentence as follows:"If the bandwidth of a solicited EHT TB PPDU is less than 320 MHz, then B39 of the corresponding User Info field in the Trigger frame \*of EHT variant\* is set to 0 | RevisedAgree with the commenter in principleRevised the text to say “EHT variant User Info field in the Trigger frame”.Tgbe editor please implement changes as shown in doc 11-21/1486r1 tagged as #4323 |

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGbe Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGbe Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGbe Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGbe Editor” are instructions to the TGbe editor to modify existing material in the TGbe draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGbe editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGbe Draft.***

***TGbe editor: Please update the 2nd paragraph in subclause 9.3.1.22.1.2 (P100L58 in D1.1) as follows:***

All User Info fields (including the Special User Info field) in the User Info List field of a Trigger frame have the same length unless the Trigger

frame is an MU-BAR (#5117) Trigger frame (see 9.3.1.22.4 (MU-BAR Trigger frame format) and 9.3.1.22.1.3 (Special User Info field)).

***TGbe editor: Please update the 3rd and the 4th paragraphs in subclause 9.3.1.22.1.2 (P101L2 in D1.1) and add two NOTEs below Table 9-29g1 as followings:***

A User Info field that is addressed to a non-AP STA is either an HE variant or an EHT variant. The User

Info field is an HE variant addressed to a non-AP EHT STA if the B39 of the User Info field is set to 0 and the B54 of the Common Info field is set to 1 in the Trigger frame; otherwise, it is an EHT variant. (#7685)B39 of an HE variant User Info field is reserved for a non-EHT HE STA. B39is set to 0 for an HE variant User Info field by an EHT AP, and is the PS160 subfield for an EHT variant User Info field. Table 9-29g1 (Valid combinations of B54 and B55 in the Common Info field, B39 in the User Info field, and solicited TB PPDU format) defines valid combinations of the B54 and B55 in the Common Info field, the B39 in the User Info field, the presence of the Special User Info field in the Trigger frame(#7686), the variant of a User Info field, and the corresponding TB PPDU type.

**Table 9-29g1—Valid combinations of B54 and B55 in the Common Info field, B39 in the User Info field, and solicited TB PPDU format**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Common Info field B54** | **Common Info field B55** | **User Info field B39** | **Presence of Special User Info field** | **User Info field variant** | **TB PPDU****type** |
| 1 | 1 | 0 | No | HE variant | HE |
| 0 | 0 | 0 | Yes | EHT variant | EHT |
| 0 | 0 | 1 | Yes | EHT variant | EHT |
| 1 | 0 | 1 | Yes | EHT variant | EHT |
| 1 | 0 | 0 | Yes | HE variant | HE |
| NOTE 1—A non-AP EHT STA with dot11EHTBaseLineFeaturesImplementedOnly equal to true does not respond with a TB PPDU to a Trigger frame that does not follow the combinations listed in this table (see 35.4.2.3.3 (Conditions for not responding with an TB PPDU)). (#5510) NOTE 2—The last row in this table allows a non-AP EHT STA to transmit an HE TB PPDU in the primary 160 MHz as a response to a Trigger frame that contains a Special User Info field. (#6696) |

(#7896)

***TGbe editor: Please insert the following paragraph to 35.4.2.3.1 (P329L57 in D1.1) as the 3rd paragraph***

(#7896)An EHT STA shall not transmit an EHT TB PPDU if the B55 of the Common Info field is set to 1.

***TGbe editor: Please update the last paragraph in subclause 9.3.1.22.1.2 (P101L33 in D1.1) as follows:***

(#7687)If B54 in the Common Info field of a Trigger frame is equal to 1, then an EHT AP with dot11EHTBaseLineFeaturesImplementedOnly equal to true does not setB55 in the Common Info field to 0 in the Trigger frame. If the bandwidth of a solicited EHT TB PPDU is less than 320 MHz, then B39 of the corresponding EHT variant(#4323) User Info field in the Trigger frame is set to 0.