IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Telecon Minutes - RCM SG – 8 June 2020 | | | | |
| Date: 2020-06-08 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Joseph LEVY | InterDigital Communication, Inc. | 111 W 33rd Street New York, NY 10120 | +1.631.622.4139 | [joseph.levy@interdigital.com](mailto:joseph.levy@interdigital.com) |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

Abstract

This document contains the minutes of the IEEE 802.11 Random and Changing MAC Addresses (RCM) Study Group (SG) teleconference held on 27 April 2020 at 10:00 hrs EDT.

Note: Highlighted text are action items.

Q- proceeds a question asked at the meeting

A- proceeds an answer given by the presenter

C- proceeds a comment

Contents

[Monday 08 June 2020, 10:00 hrs EDT: 3](#_Toc42867516)

[Administrative: 3](#_Toc42867517)

[Status Update: 3](#_Toc42867518)

[Discussion: 3](#_Toc42867519)

[Review upcoming Telecon Schedule 4](#_Toc42867520)

[AOB: 5](#_Toc42867521)

[Adjourned: 10:54 hrs. EDT 5](#_Toc42867522)

[Attendance: 6](#_Toc42867523)

[References: 7](#_Toc42867524)

# Monday 08 June 2020, 10:00 hrs EDT:

## Administrative:

**Administration:**

**Chair: Carol Ansley, CommScope**

**Acting Secretary: Joseph Levy, InterDigital**

**The teleconference was called to order by Chair 10:00 hrs. EDT,**

Joseph Levy, InterDigital volunteered to be acting secretary.

Agenda slide deck: [11-20/0733r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-02-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx) proposed agenda (slide 10) copied here for reference (the Chair noted the date had not been update on slide 10, the correct date is Monday June 8, 10:00ET):

* Administrative
  + Minutes review and approval
* Status update
* Discussion
  + [Doc 20/855 r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0855-01-0rcm-presentation-of-par-proposal-for-privacy.pptx) Presentation on Privacy PAR Proposal

* + [Doc 20/854 r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0854-01-0rcm-par-proposal-for-privacy.docx) Proposed Privacy PAR draft
* Review upcoming Telecon Schedule
  + June 22 10:00amEDT
  + July 6 10:00amEDT
  + July 20 10:00amEDT

**Approval of the Agenda:**

The Chair reviewed the agenda and called for comments or amendments to the agenda - there was no response to the call.

The proposed agenda was approved without objection.

The Chair reviewed the Administrative information in the agenda document [11-20/0733r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-02-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx) (Slides 6-9), there was no discussion. The Chair stated that straw polls were adequate for this meeting.

**Minutes review and approval:**

The Chair call for comments or amendments to the minutes from the RCM SG Telcon on 11 May: [11-20/0766r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0766-00-0rcm-telecon-minutes-rcm-sg-11-may-2020.docx). There were no comments or amendments.

The Chair call for objections to approval of the minutes, there were none. (Note: the minutes while “approved” have not been formally approved, as a motion is required).

## Status Update:

The Chair provided as RCM SG status update, reviewing [11-20/0733r2](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-02-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx) slides 11 and 12.

## Discussion:

**[Doc 20/855 r1](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0855-01-0rcm-presentation-of-par-proposal-for-privacy.pptx): Presentation on Privacy PAR Proposal – Rob Sun (Huawei):**

Q – About preserving existing mechanisms and users providing consent, what do you mean about existing mechanisms (slide 4 second bullet)?

A – By encrypting, information in the transfer – the usual place for consent shows up in the application layer. We have a lot of mechanisms – randomized mac address and encryption.

C – If you are talking about encryption then say so? I do not see the clarity about what we are talking about here.

A – Trying to support the existing schemes and add new schemes.

C – On slide 3 suggests going beyond going beyond 802e and slide 4 suggests we maintain existing user privacy provide by 802.11. User data is usually above layer two, so the assignment the data privacy practices is typically out of scope for 802.11. How we can address assessors and regulators needs?

A – The ethnical data collection requires the user to be aware. Today in 802.11az – for location – the data developed in 802.11az is being used to analyze the location of the users. Assessing the data privacy impact – we would provide interfaces to provide the mechanisms to assist assessors and regulators (MLME information). Operators may need some open interfaces to provide the privacy protection.

Q – Is the technical framework to allow regulators/assessors to access information?

A – To provide the operator information.

C – 802e – this group should overlap with our work. There are areas in 802.11 that are not covered by 802e and there may be areas where we need specific 802.11 capabilities. Privacy is holistic – it is both a technology and a framework. 802e is more general we need to define specific 802.11 items in the PAR.

[**Doc 20/854 r1**](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0854-01-0rcm-par-proposal-for-privacy.docx)**: Proposed Privacy PAR draft - Rob Sun (Huawei):**

The highlighted (yellow) text in 11-20/854r1 are the proposed new text/changes, the proposed text may need additional work. In section 8.1, it is proposed to delete numbered lines 1-6.

C – 802.11 should be limited to layer 2 and layer 1 and not be addressing higher layers. Though 802.11 could define a framework for privacy. If we go beyond 802.11’s technical scope, into regulation, we get into a difficult area. So, we should stay away from things beyond layers 1 and 2, avoiding regulation requirements.

C – Suggest changing the “regulatory practice” to “best practice”.

C – Regulation – involve politicians and will change – we should avoid regulation. Regarding enhanced service (2.1), should we say enhanced, what does it mean to be enhanced? The document that came out of the TIG had some depth it should be used to focus the scope for this PAR.

A - The wording could be improved – there have been a lot of suggestion. I will combine them and update the draft.

C – Suggest reviewing the following contribution: [11-14/1554r0](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/14/11-14-1554-00-0wng-a-flexible-802-11-element-to-carry-privacy-information.docx) “A flexible 802.11 element to carry privacy information” – Mark RISON (Samsung). In different locations you may have different regulations and rules.

A – I will consider this previous contribution when updating the draft.

Rob Sun agreed to update the PAR draft.

The Chair asked if an overview of 802.E might be helpful to support the work on the privacy PAR.

Jerome Henry (Cisco Systems, Inc., who is the 802.E editor) volunteered to support generating an overview document.

## Review upcoming Telecon Schedule

The Chair reminded the group that:

1. the next meeting will be Monday 22 June, 10:00 am EDT
2. additional telecons are scheduled for:
   1. Monday 6 July, 10:00 am EDT
   2. Monday 20 July, 10:00 am EDT.
3. that contributions for the PARs and CSDs are desired

## AOB:

The Chair called for any other business.

An administration question was asked: How does one register attendance what is the attendance used for?

The Chair stated we are using IMAT for attendance – the attendance is used for the minutes, so that there is a record of who was present on the telecon. There is currently no attendance credit for teleconference attendance.

The Secretary provided the IMAT link in the telecon chat window, for the participants convenience.

## Adjourned: 10:54 hrs. EDT

Note: final agenda slide deck is: [11-20/0733r3](https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/20/11-20-0733-03-0rcm-rcm-sg-telecon-agenda-may.pptx)

# Attendance:

The following recorded their attendance in the 802.11 imat attendance tool, or were noted on the Webex attendee list:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name** | **Affiliation** |
| Aboulmagd, Osama | Huawei Technologies Co. Ltd |
| Agrawal, Sandeep | C-DOT/Centre for Development of Telematics |
| Ansley, Carol | CommScope |
| Au, Kwok Shum (Edward) | Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd |
| Bredewoud, Albert | Broadcom Corporation |
| Carney, William | Sony Corporation |
| Das, Dibakar | Intel |
| de la Oliva Delgado, Antonio | InterDigital, Inc. |
| Dong, Xiandong | Xiaomi Inc. |
| Hamilton, Mark | Ruckus/CommScope |
| Henry, Jerome | Cisco Systems, Inc. |
| Hervieu, Lili | Cable Television Laboratories Inc. (CableLabs) |
| Kain, Carl | Noblis, Inc. |
| Levy, Joseph | InterDigital, Inc. |
| McCann, Stephen | BlackBerry |
| Palm, Stephen | Broadcom Corporation |
| Riegel, Maximilian | Nokia |
| RISON, Mark | Samsung Cambridge Solution Centre |
| Sun, Bo | ZTE Corporation |
| Sun, Rob\* | Huawei |
| Yee, Peter | NSA-CSD |

\*did not indicate attendance via IMAT – though did attend/contribute to the teleconference.

# References: