IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Comment resolutions for miscellneous comments | | | | |
| Date: 2019-11-1 | | | | |
| Author(s): | | | | |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Minyoung Park | Intel Corporation |  |  | Minyoung.park@intel.com |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions for multiple comments related to TGba D4.0 with the following CIDs:

4051, 4071, 4123

Revisions:

* Rev 0: Initial version of the document.

Interpretation of a Motion to Adopt

A motion to approve this submission means that the editing instructions and any changed or added material are actioned in the TGba Draft. This introduction is not part of the adopted material.

***Editing instructions formatted like this are intended to be copied into the TGba Draft (i.e. they are instructions to the 802.11 editor on how to merge the text with the baseline documents).***

***TGba Editor: Editing instructions preceded by “TGba Editor” are instructions to the TGba editor to modify existing material in the TGba draft. As a result of adopting the changes, the TGba editor will execute the instructions rather than copy them to the TGba Draft.***

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Commenter** | **Clause Number** | **Page** | **Line** | **Comment** | **Proposed Change** | **Resolution** |
| 4051 | Joseph Levy | 11.3 | 85 | 24 | Class 3 frames are frames that can be sent between any pair STAs that that are Authenticated and Associated (State 3 or State 4), that support the frame type, and if the STAs are using PS mode are both awake. WUR PPDU frames (WRU Wake-up and WUR Short Wake-up) can only be sent from a WUR AP to a WUR non-AP STA when the WUR non-AP STA is WUR awake state. Hence WUR PPDUs are not class 3 frames. Therefore, they should be not listed a class 3 frames. WUR mode requires a new class of frames to be defined. | Delete: "4) WUR frames i) WUR Wake-up ii) WUR Short Wake-up"  Add: "d) Class 4 frames 1) WUR frames i) WUR Wake-up (only WUR APs can send WUR Wake-up frames) ii) WUR Short Wake-up (only WUR APs can send WUR Short Wake-up frames)  Also add: State 5 and State 6 to 11.3.1:  . -- State 5: Authenticated (except DMG STAs that did not perform IEEE 802.11 authentication, which are unauthenticated), associated (Pending RSNA Authentication), and in WUR mode. The IEEE 802.1X Controlled Port is blocked. -- State 6: Authenticated (except DMG STAs that did not perform IEEE 802.11 authentication, which are unauthenticated), associated (RSNA Established or Not Required), and in WUR mode. The IEEE 802.1X Controlled Port is unblocked, or not present.  Also add: State 5 and State 6 to 11.3.2 figure where State 5 goes out of and returns to State 3, and State 6 goes out of and returns to State 4, depending on if the WUR mode is active or not. | Rejected.  In the latest draft REVmd D3.0, the definition of Class 3 frames is as follows and there are no other definitions regarding what the commenter is describing:  “c) Class 3 frames  1) Data frames  i) Data frames between STAs in an infrastructure BSS or in an MBSS  2) Management frames  i) In an infrastructure BSS, an MBSS, or a PBSS, all Action and Action No Ack frames  except those that are declared to be Class 1 or Class 2 frames  3) Control frames  i) PS-Poll  ii) Poll  iii) SPR  iv) DMG DTS  v) Block Ack (BlockAck), except those that are declared to be Class 1  vi) Block Ack Request (BlockAckReq), except those that are declared to be Class 1 (above)”  Similar to the PS-Poll frame (transmitted from a non-AP STA to the AP with which the non-AP STA is associated), which is listed as a control frame under the Class 3 frames, WUR frames can be listed as Class 3 frames. |
| 4071 | Osama Aboulmagd | 10.2.1 | 83 | 39 | I have submitted this comment before and I am still not satisfied with the resolution (Rejected). Figure 10.1 adds WUR PHY to the list of other PHYs. WUR PHY is different from all other PHYs in that it is NOT a standalone PHY. It is an auxiliary PHY. As stated in clause 4.3.15b a WUR STA is an no-HT, VHT,...etc. Since WUR PHY is not equivalent to other PHYs its place in Figure 10.1 need to evaluated and reflect the nature of WUR PHY. | As in comment | Rejected.  VHT STA uses HT PHY even though it has its own definitions of VHT PHY and the 802.11 spec doesn’t treat the VHT PHY as an auxiliary PHY. HT PHY is used to transmit and receive HT PPDU and VHT PHY is used to transmit and receive VHT PPDU and this is done by a same VHT STA. In a similar way, WUR PHY is defined to transmit and receive WUR PPDU and if WUR STA is VHT STA, it can also transmit VHT PPDU using VHT PHY. Therefore, WUR PHY is equivalent to other PHYs and the Figure 10.1 is correct. |
| 4123 | Xiaofei Wang | 3.2 | 21 | 54 | the statement "MC-OOK Off symbol where the multicarrier signal is not present." is probably not correct. Does it imply that when no energy or signal is present? Or just that multi-carrier signal is not present but there may some other signals? | change the phrase to "MC-OOK Off symbol where no signal is present." | Accepted. |