IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

|  |
| --- |
| Comment Resolution on CID 4210 and 4211 |
| Date: 2019-3-12 |
| Author(s): |
| Name | Affiliation | Address | Phone | email |
| Takenori Sakamoto | Panasonic |  |  | sakamoto.takenori@jp.panasonic.com |
| Hiroyuki Motozuka | Panasonic |  |  |  |

Abstract

This submission proposes resolutions to CIDs 4210 and 4211.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4210 | 3.2 | 21 | The definition of A-PPDU is not clear as the conjunction is missing between IFS and preamble. Also it is not clear that the first PPDU has a PHY preamble, while the following aggregated PPDUs do not. Lastly, IFS needs to be expanded. | Change:"A sequence of two or more PPDUs transmitted without IFS, preamble, and with a PHY header between PPDU transmissions"to:"A sequence of two or more PPDUs transmitted without an interframe space (IFS). The PPDU(s) transmitted following the first PPDU in the sequence do not contain PHY preamble(s), only PHY header(s) and PHY service data unit(s) (PSDU(s))." |

**Proposed resolution**: Accept

**Discussion:**

*Change the following definition*

**aggregate physical layer (PHY) protocol data unit (A-PPDU)**: A sequence of two or more PPDUs transmitted without an interframe space (IFS). The PPDU(s) transmitted following the first PPDU in the sequence do not contain PHY preamble(s), only PHY header(s) and PHY service data unit(s) (PSDU(s)). ~~IFS, preamble, and with a PHY header between PPDU transmissions~~.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **CID** | **Clause** | **Page** | **Comment** | **Proposed change** |
| 4211 | 3.2 | 21 | The definition of DMG A-PPDU and EDMG A-PPDU is very confusing. Since DMG is defined to include both non-EDMG and EDMG, why is a separate definition necessary for DMG and EDMG A-PPDUs? If the intent is to limit the DMG A-PPDU to non-EDMG PPDUs then it should say so. However, this would be very confusing. Are these definitions necessary? | Delete the definitions for: DMG A-PPDU and EDGM A-PPDU. |

**Proposed resolution:** Reject

**Discussion:** A DMG PPDU does not include an EDMG PPDU. The definition of DMG PPDU and EDMG PPDU are unique and mutually exclusive. This is not the same case of the term DMG STA, which also includes an EDMG STA. This is the precedence that has been established by HT, VHT and HE.

**Straw Poll:**

* Do you agree to accept the comment resolution for CIDs 4210 and 4211 in 19/0363r1?

**References:**

1. Draft P802.11ay\_D3.0